Investigative Report on the Role of CCP in the Eutelsat Termination of NTDTV Broadcast (I)

April 7, 2005

Background

New Tang Dynasty TV (NTDTV) is an independent, nonprofit Chinese language TV broadcaster established by overseas Chinese with headquarters in New York City. NTDTV began broadcasting via satellite in North America in February 2002 and extended its 24/7 simulcast programming to cover Asia, Europe, and Australia in July 2003. The signal into Asia including Mainland China is transmitted via W5 satellite owned by the European Telecommunication Satellite operator Eutelsat, headquartered in Paris, France [1]. However, Eutelsat recently decided to unilaterally terminate NTDTV broadcast. Because NTDTV is the only non-governmental TV that broadcasts to China uncensored and in Mandarin, NTDTV opened a historic "open satellite window" in the great "fire-wall" of information control that had been forcibly maintained by the CCP for several decades. The decision by Eutelsat allows the CCP to regain complete control over TV broadcast inside China [2].

The facts provided in this report clearly demonstrated that the repression of NTDTV by CCP is systematic, protracted and malicious. It involves many offices of both CCP Central Committee and Central Government, and the overall coordination efforts among the various departments were directly managed by the Standing Committee of the Politburo of CCP.

The Involvement of the Ministry of Information Industry of PRC

On December 6, 2004, ChinaSatCom, Eutelsat (the owner of the W5 satellite) and its Italian subsidiary Skylogic signed a contract to build a broadband Sino-European satellite service network [3]. Because the Chinese government prohibits foreign investment in the market unless the foreign satellite operator partners with a domestic satellite company such as ChinaSatCom [4], up until now, foreign companies have only entered the field of telecommunication value added market in Mainland China [5]. Telecommunication providers in Germany, Australia, Korea, and Hong Kong SAR have expressed interest to work with China Railway Communication Co. Ltd., but an agreement is yet to be reached. The plan of ChinaSatCom to team up with Nextel, a US cell phone and two-way radio operator, on a joint venture to providing mobile communication services in China is awaiting approval from the government. However, the partnership between ChinaSatCom and Eutelsat to provide broadband satellite service in China was quickly approved by the high level government [6]. Jiang Yaoping, Vice Minister of Ministry of the Information Industry attended the contract signing ceremony [3]. According to expert analysis, the amount of money involved in this contract is not great; the published annual turnover is only around 4-5 million US dollars, while the service provided in the agreement can be better replaced with more reliable means. Obviously, the implication of this contract far exceeds the contract itself.

ChinaSatCom was established with approval from the CCP Central Committee and is under the Ministry of Information Industry. All of the high-level officials at ChinaSatCom are appointed by CCP's Central Enterprise Task Force Committee [7]; therefore from any perspective the activity of ChinaSatCom is never pure business. In May 2004, when NTDTV transmission over Asia via W5 of Eutelsat was barely one month into operation, the Ministry of Information Industry directly asked Eutelsat through ChinaSatCom to terminate NTDTV transmission [8].

The Involvement of the State Administration of Radio, Film and Television

On December 16, 2003, the China State Administration of Radio, Film and Television sent an urgent classified telegram to radio and television bureaus in all provinces, autonomous regions and cities. The telegram contained orders regarding the Inaugural Global Chinese New Year Gala created by NTDTV. The order stated, "Must halt or knockout [the Gala]","Minimize its influence","Do not grant any interview","groups traveling overseas are strictly forbidden to attend this Gala","strictly forbid rebroadcast [of the Gala]", and "intensify propaganda abroad to counteract the influence [of the Gala]" among other specific rules [9].

To investigate the criminal conduct of all institutions, organizations, and individuals involved in the persecution of Falun Gong; to bring such investigations, no matter how long it takes, no matter how far and deep we have to search, to full closure; to exercise fundamental principles of humanity; and to restore and uphold justice in society.
Wang Lili, head of the Discipline Inspection Group, part of the Chinese Communist Party Central Discipline Inspection Committee stationed at the State Administration of Radio, Film and Television spoke at a Task Force Meeting reviewing the Bureau performance in 2003. In her speech she specifically mentioned the "Inaugural Global Chinese New Year Gala" held by NTDTV in New York City, as well as other cities in the world. Further, she called the worldwide satellite broadcast of the NTDTV Gala a "Direct rivalry to the CCTV's own Chinese Spring Festival Gala"[10].

CCTV under the State Administration of Radio, Film and Television asserted pressure to its foreign partner satellite companies to stop these companies from signing long-term contract or broadcasting programs for NTDTV [11].

On March 22, 2005, China Society of Motion Picture and Television Engineers and Satellite TV & IP Multimedia magazine jointly held the (CCBN2005) Satellite Business Development Forum in Beijing. For the first time Eutelsat was invited to the forum. This event was held less than three months after the "historical agreement" between Eutelsat and ChinaSatCom was signed in December 2004. This forum received great support from the State Administration of Radio, Film and Television [12].

The Involvement of Foreign Embassies and consulates under the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the PRC

The principal tactics used by the PRC foreign embassies and consulates to interfere and disrupt NTDTV includes:

1. Writing letters to local government officials, scholars, public figures; demanding them not to send greetings to major events organized by NTDTV, accepting interviews by NTDTV. A typical example was the many letters wrote in January 2004 to professors of various Law Schools in the country by Zhou Xiaomei, Consul for Political & Press Affairs of Chinese Consulate General in Los Angeles. She asked them not to grant interviews regarding to the NTDTV "Global Inaugural Gala" [13] The Chinese Consulate General in Toronto, Canada also sent similar letters to Canadian government officials in the same month. [14]

2. Attacking NTDTV in public gatherings or in news media, demanding society, especially Chinese society not to support NTDTV. On November 5 and December 18, 2003 the Chinese Consulate General in Sydney, Australia wrote an article on Australian Chinese Daily, and stated publicly denouncing NTDTV and Epochtimes, respectively. In another occasion on January 14 2004, in her first press conference the Acting Consul General Tien Chunyan specifically asked Chinese foreign nationals to "especially distinguish" NTDTV. [17]

3. Furthermore, there had been many reports relating to how Chinese Consulates either directly involved or indirectly pressured certain Chinese organizations to prevent or disrupt normal NTDTV news gathering activities.

Involvement of the Ministry of Public Security, PRC

From October 19 to 20, 2004, the 26th Bureau (the so-called "Anti-cult" operations bureau established specifically to suppress Falun Gong) of the Ministry of Public Security, PRC held a director level meeting in Shenzhen City involving the "610 Offices" of the Public Security Bureaus from 9 provinces and major cities, including Beijing City, Shanghai City, Tianjin City, Guangdong Province, Shandong Province, Jiangsu Province, Shanxi Province, Hunan Province. In the meeting they planned and deployed specific intelligence gathering and investigation operations against "Epochtimes," "NTDTV," and "Sound of Hope Radio Network" [18].

Involvement of the highest level within the CCP

Because the PRC State Administration of Radio, Film and Television is under the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Propaganda of the CCP Central Committee, the speech by Wang Lili involved at least two important organizations within the CCP Central Committee: the Central Discipline Inspection Committee and the Department of Propaganda. Yet, the classified telegram by the Chinese State Administration of Radio, Film and Television clearly indicated the order of "Must halt or knockout [the Gala]" came directly from the "Party Central Leaders." Both Ministry of Information Industry and Ministry of Foreign Affairs are under the PRC State Council. Even though the Ministry of Public Security was also under the PRC State Council, it must also obey the leadership of the Political and Judicial Committee of CCP Central Committee. Further, when handling issues related to Falun Gong it must report directly to the CCP Party Central Committee's Leadership Team.
to deal with Falun Gong issues and its administration office (610 Office). This incident directly involved with the CCP party administrations and the various central government's offices. Since these organizations do not have any direct organizational relationships, then the coordination among these organizations must come from an even higher level of the administration, which is the Politburo Standing Committee of CCP.

The following is the initial list of officials allegedly participating in the suppressing of NTDTV

**The officials alleged/suspected in the command and control of suppressing NTDTV**

**Jiang Zemin**: former Secretary of Communist Party Central Committee

**Luo Gan**: Member of the CCP Politburo Standing Committee, Secretary of the CCP Central Political and Judiciary Committee.

**Zhou Yongkang**: Member of the CCP Politburo Standing Committee, Minister of the Ministry of Public Security.

**Li Changchun**: Member of the CCP Politburo Standing Committee, responsible for party propaganda operations.

**Liu Yunshan**: Head of Department of Propaganda of CCP Central Committee.

**Zhang Yue**: Chief of the 26th Bureau of the Ministry of Public Security

**Officials allegedly having directly involved with the Eutelsat to terminate the broadcasting of NTDTV programs**

**Wang Xudong**: [19] Minister of the Ministry of Information Industry (since February 17 2003). He was named the Hebei Province Party Committee Secretary in June 2000. On November 16 2002, he was named the Party Team Secretary within the Ministry of Information Industry and Vice Minister. He was promoted to the Minister position of MII on March 17 2003, as well as the party Team Secretary. During his term as the Party Secretary of the Hebei Province, large numbers of Falun Gong practitioners were persecuted to death or crippled and disfigured while he faithfully followed and implemented the policies to suppress Falun Gong. Wang Xudong was served with a lawsuit in Chicago by Falun Gong practitioners while visiting the U.S. in June 2004.

**Zhang Hainan**: [20] Managing Director of the ChinaSatCom Group, Inc (since May 2002), and its Party Secretary. Personal ID is 610302194504092035. He had held various high level government and party positions such as Chief of the Electronics Industry Office in Shanxi Province, Members of the Shanxi Provincial Government Party Team, Assistant to the Governor of Shanxi Province, Director of the Shanxi Province Economic and Trade Committee, Vice Secretary of the Chinese Communist Party of Shanxi Province Industry Committee. On November 2001, he was named to the position of acting Party Secretary of the ChinaSatCom Group, Inc and Vice Managing Director. He was promoted to the current position of Managing Director in May 2002.

**References:**

[1] NTDTV About us (Back)

To investigate the criminal conduct of all institutions, organizations, and individuals involved in the persecution of Falun Gong; to bring such investigations, no matter how long it takes, no matter how far and deep we have to search, to full closure; to exercise fundamental principles of humanity; and to restore and uphold justice in society.
To investigate the criminal conduct of all institutions, organizations, and individuals involved in the persecution of Falun Gong; to bring such investigations, no matter how long it takes, no matter how far and deep we have to search, to full closure; to exercise fundamental principles of humanity; and to restore and uphold justice in society.

[9] The State Administration of Radio, Film and Television classified telegram: "Regarding the 'First Global Chinese New Year Gala' by 'Falun Gong'".
A list of CCP suppression and interference with NTDTV:

• In 2002, Taipei International Satellite Broadcasting Corp decided to carry programs from NTDTV. After coercion from the CCTV, Taipei International withdrew the contract with NTDTV. Then CCTV then renewed their contract.

• In February 2003, Atlanta-based US operator ADTH broke an agreement to carry NTDTV for fear of losing contracts with CCTV.

• On July 1, 2003, Netherlands-based satellite operator New Skies Satellites had begun broadcasting the NTDTV channel on open signal to Asia. Three days later, Beijing threatened NSS with financial reprisals, and NSS encrypted the signal, preventing Chinese satellite dish owners from seeing the channel. Finally NSS completely ended its NTDTV program transmission on May 1, 2004 under the mounting pressure from CCP.

• In July 2003, the "Public Access Satellite Channel" which signed an agreement with NTDTV, after transmitting NTDTV" program for several days, received heavy pressure from the CCP. It then encrypted the signal of NTDTV.

• In the beginning of 2004, Manila based Mabuhay Philippines Satellite Corporation was forced to cancel the transmission of the First NTDTV Chinese New Year Gala due to threats from the CCP, right before they were about to broadcast it.

• PanAmSat, which carries the Chinese state run CCTV on many of its satellite platforms worldwide, has also refused to carry NTDTV programs.

• In March 2004, NTDTV rented W5 Asia beam satellite by Eutelsat SA. In December 2004, Eutelsat announced its "historic partnership agreement" with ChinaSatCom. In March 2005, Eutelsat unilaterally decided not to renew contract with NTDTV, although there are plenty of excessive capacity on the W5 satellite.

• [Reporters Without Borders (Reporters sans frontieres)] Chinese authorities put pressure on France. Chinese-language NTDTV harassed by Beijing.
[12] China Cable Broadcasting Network, CCBN2005 satellite industry development discussion forum, April 4, 2005]
[18] Meeting minutes of the meeting of the directors of the "610 Offices" of 9 provinces and cities Public Security Bureau organized by the 26th Bureau, Ministry of Public Security.
[20] ChinaSatCom The leaders of the company.